

REVIEW

of the official reviewer for dissertation work

of Orazayeva Assem Zhanatayevna on the theme «The effects of financial indicators on the level of Corporate Social Responsibility of firms from developing countries» presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the speciality «8D04105 – Finance».

№	Criteria	Eligibility (one of the options must be checked)	Justification of the position of the official reviewer
1.	The topic of the thesis (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of development of science and/or state programs	1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs:	The study examines the topic of Corporate Social Responsibility, which is in compliance with priority areas of science development of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as in the context of the global business agenda. The topic of the dissertation corresponds to the goals of the address Strategy "Kazakhstan - 2050": a new political course of an established state". Namely, the first and second challenges of the Strategy "The economic policy of the new deal is a comprehensive economic pragmatism based on the principles of profitability, return on investment and competitiveness" and "comprehensive support for entrepreneurship – the leading force of the national economy"
		1) The thesis was completed within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (indicate the name and number of the project or program) 2) The thesis was completed within the framework of another state program (indicate the name of the program) 3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of the development of	The topic is relevant to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) formulated by the United Nations on 25 September of 2015 as part of the Sustainable Development agenda, aimed at transforming the world by 2030. The

		science, approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (indicate the direction)	<p>Republic of Kazakhstan, as a full member of the United Nations, also adopted SDGs.</p> <p>In addition, the dissertation topic is relevant to the 10 priorities for the development of science approved at the meeting of the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission for 2021, in particular:</p> <p>1. Rational use of resources, animal and planet life, ecology.</p>
2.	Importance for science	The work makes/does not make a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well disclosed/not disclosed	<p>Scientific research engages into the search of truth followed by the theoretical review that was provided by the doctoral candidate in the context of the modern business environment. Corporate Social Responsibility concept is relatively new, and its impacts as well as motivators, especially in the context of developing parts of the world are not well understood. This study examines the effects of financial motivators on the socially responsible behavior of the firm, which received little coverage in prior literature. The significance and novelty of the research are well disclosed in the dissertation.</p>
3.	The principle of independence	<p>Self-reliance level:</p> <p>1) High;</p> <p>2) Medium;</p> <p>3) Low;</p> <p>4) No independence</p>	<p>The work was completed independently, as evidenced by the research carried out within the framework of the dissertation and the doctoral student's contribution to each publication where she is the</p>

4.	The principle of inner unity	<p>4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>Justified</u>; 2) Partially justified; 3) Not justified. 	<p>corresponding author.</p> <p>The relevance of the thesis is justified. Nowadays, CSR has been gaining increasing attention, as seen from the development of global sustainability agenda, aimed at decreasing the environmental impacts of corporations, as well as enhancing their social commitments towards community and environment. The doctoral student provides examples that support the relevance of the research topic in the introduction chapter.</p>
		<p>4.2 The content of the thesis reflects the topic of the thesis:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>Reflects</u>; 2) Partially reflects; 3) Does not reflect 	<p>The topic of the doctoral dissertation is disclosed in the content of the work. Consistently with the topic of the thesis, the dissertation suggests a methodological and theoretical basis for studying the impacts of financial indicators on the level of social responsibility of firms from developing countries. The author of the work justifies the selection for studying the CSR-financial performance relationship, as well as the choice of developing countries context.</p>
		<p>4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the thesis:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>correspond</u>; 2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond 	<p>The introduction of the thesis outlines the study purpose and objectives, while Chapter 2 of the dissertation is devoted to setting the theoretical framework of the study, which includes a more detailed discussion of objectives and study hypotheses. The study purpose</p>

			and objectives refer to determining the impact of different financial measures on CSR, which in turn comply with the research topic.
		4.4 All sections and provisions of the thesis are logically interconnected: 1) <u>completely interconnected</u> ; 2) the interconnection is partial; 3) there is no interconnection	All sections and provisions of the thesis are logically interconnected. The work exhibits internal integrity and is presented in a clear and logical manner. Chapters of the work flow from one to the next, with a clear relationship between the sections and stages of the study.
		4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are reasoned and evaluated in comparison with the known solutions: 1) <u>there is a critical analysis</u> ; 2) partial analysis; 3) the analysis does not represent one's own opinions, but quotes from other authors	The author presents a critical analysis at each stage of the dissertation, justifying the choice of research topic, theoretical base, and selected methods for examining the effects of financial indicators on CSR. The author identified literature gaps, justified the selection of variables and underlying theories, and presented a comparison of different regression methods in addition to the main estimation model.
5.	Scientific novelty principle	5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new? 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u> ; 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The novelty of scientific results and provisions is evidenced from the following: 1. The study examines the motives of socially responsible behavior, which received limited coverage in prior literature. 2. Research design of the study is new. In particular, the set of utilized variables and estimation techniques

			is novel. In particular, the author examines the effects of different financial performance measures, uses aggregate as well as separate components of CSR, introduces the variables at the macro-level, and suggests instrumental variable technique to address the problem of endogeneity.
		5.2 Are the dissertation findings new? 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u> ; 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The dissertation presents findings that are novel to academic literature due to its unique research setting. The findings of the dissertation suggest interesting implications, which lead to practical recommendations.
		5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and reasonable: 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u> ; 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The development and execution of the research and the relevant decisions are all new and successfully conducted.
6.	The validity of the main findings	All main conclusions <u>are</u> /are not based on scientifically significant evidence or well-grounded (for qualitative research and areas of training in the arts and humanities)	The author of the thesis conducted quantitative research which applies well-established theories to understanding the impacts of financial indicators on CSR. The selection of the main estimation model is also justified, arguing that the technique is selected to minimize measurement errors and decrease the potential of incorrect conclusions and enhance research validity. Using a particular methodological framework and empirical methods provides further

			validity to the research.
7.	The main provisions for the defense	<p>It is necessary to answer the following questions for each provision separately:</p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) proven; 2) rather proven; 3) rather not proven; 4) not proven <p>7.2 Is it trivial?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) yes; 2) no <p>7.3 Is it new?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) yes; 2) no <p>7.4 Application level:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) narrow; 2) medium; 3) wide <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) yes; 2) no 	<p>The work tested the following research provisions through empirical research:</p> <p>Provision 1: Higher profitability is associated with a higher level of CSR.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven? Yes, the author described the theoretical basis for selecting profitability as a potential motivator of more socially responsible behavior by firms in developing countries based on Carroll's pyramid of CSR, organizational slack theory, and evidence in prior related literature.</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial? No, the author suggested different measures of financial profitability and examined their impacts on both CSR as well separate CSR components.</p> <p>7.3 Is it new? Yes, within the established research framework there were no prior studies.</p> <p>7.4 Application level: Wide. Based on the study results, the author suggested recommendations that are applicable both at the firm as well as the government level.</p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) yes <p>Orazayeva A., Arslan M. Nexus</p>

between Corporate social responsibility disclosure and stock returns of Russian firms // The Journal of Economic Research & Business Administration. – 2021. - Vol.4, №138. - P. 71-80.

Provision 2: Higher slack resource base is associated with higher CSR. Yes, the author described the theoretical basis for selecting organizational slack as a potential motivator of more socially responsible behavior by firms in developing countries based on Carroll's pyramid of CSR, organizational slack theory, and evidence in prior related literature.

7.2 Is it trivial? No, impacts of organizational slack both CSR as well separate CSR components received limited coverage in previous literature.

7.3 Is it new? Yes, within the established research framework there were no prior studies.

7.4 Application level: Wide. Based on the study results, the author suggested recommendations that are applicable both at the firm as well as the government level.

7.5 Is it proven in the article?

1) yes

Orazayeva A., Arslan M. Impact of the management structure and compensation on financial performance

of Kazakhstani companies // CAER. – 2020. – Vol.5, №134. - P. 86-105.

Orazayeva A., Arslan M. Employee Ownership, Corporate Social Responsibility and Financial performance: Evidence from the UK // International Journal of Managerial and Financial Accounting. – 2022. – Vol. 14, №4. – P. 362-377.

Provision 3: The association between a firm's level of leverage and CSR is negative. Yes, the author described the theoretical basis for selecting leverage as a potential constraint of more socially responsible behavior by firms in developing countries based on stakeholder theory and evidence in prior related literature.

7.2 Is it trivial? No, impacts of leverage on both CSR as well separate CSR components in the context of developing countries received limited coverage.

7.3 Is it new? Yes, within the established research framework there were no prior studies.

7.4 Application level: Wide. Based on the study results, the author suggested recommendations that are applicable both at the firm as well as the government level.

7.5 Is it proven in the article?

1) yes

Orazayeva A., Arslan M. CSR and financial performance in the airline industry: moderating effects of the airline type, government ownership and COVID-19 // International Journal of Electronic Finance. – 2022. – Vol. 11, №3. – P. 219-234.

8.

The principle of reliability
Reliability of sources and information provided

8.1 Choice of methodology - is justified or the methodology is described in sufficient detail

1) yes;

2) no

The author clearly explained the choice of methodology and described it in sufficient detail, proved applied methodology in the research. The author outlined potential statistical biases and suggested solutions to minimize potential errors.

8.2 The results of the thesis were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies:

1) yes;

2) no

The results of the thesis were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies. In particular, the author applied Eviews statistical package for data analysis and empirical testing; Refinitiv and Worldbank databases were employed as secondary data sources.

8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns have been proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results have been proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment):

1) yes;

The author conducted quantitative research to test the study hypotheses and conceptual framework and made appropriate conclusions.

		2) no	
		8.4 Important statements are <u>confirmed</u> / partially confirmed / not confirmed by references to current and reliable scientific literature	The statements are confirmed and authenticated by literature. The informed and well-read nature of the research is evidenced by the reference list containing the leading material in the literature
		8.5 Used literature sources are <u>sufficient</u> /not sufficient for a literature review	The usage of literature to support the motivation and result are sufficient. The author conducted an extensive literature review and identified literature gaps that the study intends to fill in.
9	Practical value principle	9.1 The thesis has theoretical value: 1) <u>yes</u> ; 2) no	The author clearly states the theoretical value of current research in the introduction section of the work which includes presenting novel evidence on the topic based on the unique research design, and a better understanding of the drivers of CSR in the developing world.
		9.2 The thesis is of practical importance and there is a high probability of applying the results obtained in practice: 1) <u>yes</u> ; 2) no	The practical importance of research is also explained. Practical value includes enhancement of corporate strategies, and promoting sustainability initiatives and sustainable disclosure. The results of the study can serve as a foundation for creating more effective CSR solutions relevant to developing countries in particular.
		9.3 Are the practice suggestions new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new);	Based on the study findings, the author formulated practical recommendations at both the firm and government levels.

